UNIVERSITAS NEGERI YOGYAKARTA

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

SS16-096 Submission of Information

1 message

Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id> 29 December 2016 at 10:32
To: wipsarian@uny.ac.id
Cc: "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>

Dear Mr. Wipsar Sunu Brams,

Thank you for submitting your article to the Makara Journal of Science. According to the procedure Makara Journal of Science, your article will be reviewed first by the editors.

Herewith we inform you that the article titled “UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes” get a reference number SS16-096. Please use this reference number for future communication.

Please send the originality statement letter of your article to our e-mail addresses:
editor_mss@ui.ac.id and editor.makara@gmail.com.

You can access the journal up to 2009 edition free of charge on:
http://journal.ui.ac.id/science

Best Regards,

Puji Astuti
Editorial Assisstant
Makara Journal of Science

2 attachments

JOURNAL PUBLISHING AGREEMENT.doc
28K

JOURNAL PUBLISHING AGREEMENT.pdf
82K

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

SS16-096 Revision of Manuscript

2 messages

Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id> 10 July 2017 at 11:25
To: wipsarian@uny.ac.id, rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com
Cc: "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>

Dear Author,

We would like to inform you that your article titled “UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes” (SS16-096) has been reviewed by reviewers.

Based on the comments from two reviewers, this manuscript will be acceptable with major revision. Please indicate the changes that have been made with point-by-point responses to the reviewer's comments (response letter).

Please response the comments of reviewers and submit a revised manuscript within 14 days of this notification. Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Makara Journal of Science.

Best Regards,

Puji Astuti
Editorial Assistant

3 attachments

SS16-096 MIA.rtf
95K

SS16-096 VF.rtf
97K

SS16-096 Response letter.doc
31K

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 20 July 2017 at 12:21
To: Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes
---

Dear Editor of Makara Journal of Science,

First of all, thank you for the email you have sent me regarding the review results of our manuscript. We would also like to thank the Editor for accepting the manuscript with major revision. In accordance with the request of the Editor, we submit two documents in response, that is
1. the revised version of the manuscript,

2. a response letter for the Editor and Reviewers.

Hopefully, the above documents are sufficient to consider our manuscript to be published in Makara Journal of Science.

Best regards,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc., Ph.D

[Quoted text hidden]

2 attachments

SS16-096 Revised Version.doc
1060K

SS16-096 Response letter WSBD.doc
39K

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

Manuscript SS16-096 Revision and Respond to the Reviewers (Brams Dwandaru)

2 messages

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 21 July 2017 at 17:10
To: Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id>, "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes
---

Dear Editor of Makara Journal of Science,

I have sent an email on 19th July 2017 containing the revision for the manuscript SS16-096 and a respond letter to the Editor and Reviewers. I would like to know whether you have received the documents.

Thank you in advance for your clarification.

Best regards,
Brams Dwandaru

Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id> 21 July 2017 at 17:21
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>
Cc: "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>

Dear Author,

Your revision has been received by us nicely.
The revision need to be checked from our editor.
For the attention and the cooperation, we say thank you.

Best Regards,

Puji Astuti
Editorial Assistant
Makara Journal of Science
[Quoted text hidden]
> ---
> Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
> www.uny.ac.id
> ---

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI YOGYAKARTA

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

artikel

1 message

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 27 July 2017 at 11:46
To: rhyko irawan w <rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com>

SS16-096 Revised Version.doc
1060K

UNIVERSITAS NEGERI YOGYAKARTA

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

SS16-096 Revision of Proofreading

5 messages

Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id> 29 November 2017 at 11:31
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>, rhyko irawan w <rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com>
Cc: "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>

Dear Author,

Here, we attach the result of proofreading of your manuscript which the title is “UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes" (SS16-096)

1. There are two result file from proofreading, hope it can be revised base on suggestion at CLEAN REVISED file
2. Make a response letter of question or revision from proofreading
3. Complete the abstract and title in Bahasa based on revision
4. The written form is based on GFA rules especially in reference form (the article must attach DOI)

The revision is received before December 4, 2017. For the attention and the cooperation, we say thank you.

Best Regards,

Puji Astuti
Editorial Assistant
Makara Journal of Science

2 attachments

SS16-096 Proofreading_TRACKED_REVISED.doc
1062K

SS16-096 Proofreading_CLEAN_REVISED.doc
1042K

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 2 December 2017 at 13:32
To: Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id>, rhyko irawan w <rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com>, "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>

UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes" (SS16-096)
==========
==========

Dear Editor of Makara Journal of Science,
Ibu Puji Astuti (Editorial Assistant)

First of all, thank you very much for the email. We would like to thank Makara Journal of Science in providing the proofreading of our manuscript.

1. We have revised our manuscript in accordance to the comments given in the CLEAN REVISED file of the proofreading. The revised manuscript is attached and entitled 'SS16-096 Proofreading_CLEAN_REVISED-Final'.

2. We have produced a response letter corresponding to the comments in the CLEAN REVISED file of the proofreading. The response letter is attached and entitled 'RESPONSE LETTER TO MAKARA JOURNAL OF SCIENCE'.

3. We have completed the abstract and title in Bahasa Indonesia in accordance to the CLEAN REVISED file of the proof reading. This is contained in the revised manuscript (point 1).

4. We have check and completed the Reference part such that all articles has their DOI attached. This is attached separately and entitled 'Reference SS16-096'.

Thank you in advance in accepting our manuscript to be published in Makara Journal of Science.

Best regards,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, Ph.D
Physics Education Department,
Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta

[Quoted text hidden]

3 attachments

SS16-096 Proofreading_CLEAN_REVISED-Final.doc
1054K

RESPONSE LETTER TO MAKARA JOURNAL OF SCIENCE.docx
15K

Reference SS16-096.doc
51K

Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id> 4 December 2017 at 10:35
To: "- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc" <wipsarian@uny.ac.id>
Cc: rhyko irawan w <rhyko.irawan17@gmail.com>, "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>

Dear Author,

Revisi perbaikan naskah Saudara telah kami terima dengan baik dan akan kami lanjutkan utk proses layout.
Atas kerjasamanya kami ucapkan terima kasih.

Best Regards

Puji Astuti
Editorial Assistant
Makara Journal of Science

[Quoted text hidden]
> ----------
> Untuk mendukung “Gerakan UNY Hijau”, disarankan tidak mencetak email ini dan
> lampirannya.
> (To support the “Green UNY movement”, it is recommended not to print the
> contents of this email and its attachments)

> Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta
> www.uny.ac.id
> ----------

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 6 December 2017 at 10:49
To: Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id>

Dear Editor of Makara Journal of Science,
Editorial Assistant Ibu Puji Astuti,

Kami mengucapkan terima kasih atas diterimanya revisi perbaiakan naskah yang telah kami kirimkan. terima kasih pula atas proses layouting untuk naskah kami.

Kami juga mengikuti proses evaluasi Makara Journal Science untuk dapat terindeks Scopus. Kami membaca dari evaluasi tersebut ada pernyataan "not accepted for review" karena tidak adanya 'publication ethics' dan 'malpractice statement'. Apakah ini berarti Makara belum bisa terindeks Scopus?

Kami tertarik hal ini karena kami mendukung sepenuhnya usaha Makara Journal Science untuk dapat terindeks Scopus.

Demikian, atas perhatiannya kami mengucapkan terima kasih.

Hormat kami,
Wipsar Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc., Ph.D
Jurusan Pendidikan Fisika, FMIPA, UNY

[Quoted text hidden]

- Sunu Brams Dwandaru, M.Sc <wipsarian@uny.ac.id> 19 December 2017 at 11:11
To: Makara Journal of Science <editor_mss@ui.ac.id>, "Dr. Ivandini Tribidasari A." <ivandini.tri@sci.ui.ac.id>

Dear Editor Makara Journal of Science,
Ibu Puji Astuti

Kami bermaksud menanyakan sekiranya kapan Makara Journal of Science edisi Desember 2017 ini akan terbit?

Terima kasih atas informasinya.

Best regards,
Brams Dwandaru, Ph.D
[Quoted text hidden]

UV-Visible Optical Absorbance of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc-Carbon Battery Waste via a Custom-Made Ultrasound Generator based on Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method (SS16-096)
==========

RESPONSE LETTER TO MAKARA JOURNAL OF SCIENCE

We really appreciate the Editor of Makara Journal of Science for providing the proofreading of our manuscript. We also would like to thank the proofreader expert in reviewing the language of the manuscript. Hence, in this letter we provide the responses to the comments by the proofreader.

Comment[1]: The images provided are in black and white, and this observation is therefore not readily apparent to the reader.

Response: Thank you for the comment. We provide colored pictures *for all* the figures in the manuscript. Hence, Figure 3 is definitely a colored image. It *may appear* black and white as the floor is using white tiles and the wall is painted white as well. Hence, saying the solutions are colorless or transparent is still relevant and apparent to the reader, in this case.

Comment[2]: It is not necessary to repeat the figure legend exactly in the body of the text; in fact, it can make the text more difficult to read.

Response: Thank you for the insightful comment. We definitely agree with the comment.

Comment[3]: Please check that the intended meaning has been maintained here, as the original sentence was not entirely clear.

Response: Yes, the intended meaning has been maintained here, which is even better compared to the previous same statement. Thank you for improving our manuscript.

Comment[4]: Do you mean 'very'? Or 'significantly'? 'Distinct' sounds odd in this context, please consider revising this word.

Response: Thank you again for the useful comment. We have replaced the word ‘distinctively’ to ‘significantly’ as suggested by the proofreader.

Journal: Makara Journal of Science
Manuscript ID: SS16-096
Title: **UV-Visible Optical Absorbance Study of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc Carbon Battery Wastes via Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method Utilizing a Self-Custom Made Ultrasound Generator based on Piezoelectric Probes**

General Comments to the Editor of Makara Journal of Science

First of all, we would like to express our sincere appreciations to the editor of Makara Journal of Science in accepting our manuscript with major revision. In spite of the sharp differences between Reviewer 1 and Reviewer 2, we accept the recommendation of the Editor to do careful revision and correction upon the manuscript. These major revisions include:

1. Correcting the grammatical mistakes.
2. Replacing vocabulary items with more acceptable ones.
3. Tightening sentences and phrases for more clarity.
4. Adding SEM and EDX results to further verify our finding of graphene oxide (GO) from carbon rod of ZnC battery wastes by sonication.

Points 1 to 3 are done under the supervision of Bambang Sugeng, M.Pd, Ph.D, a senior lecturer of the English Literature Department, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta.

We believe now that the information given in the manuscript is sufficiently detailed in all the parts of the manuscript, including the Introduction, Method, Results and Discussion, and Conclusion.

However, there are some following issues that need to be addressed to the reviewers. This is given below.

Reviewer 1 (SS16-096VF)

Reviewer's Comments	Author's Comments
An effort to obtain graphene oxide from dry battery waste is quite interesting and it may have novelty to published	We really appreciate the comment by the reviewer. We are continuing our effort in investigating this topic and will be reported elsewhere.
There is a very limited data (only absorbance spectrum) that is not enough to conclude that materials contain GO.	We understand the concern put forward by the reviewer. That is why we have added SEM and EDX results in the manuscript to show further evidence of GO presence in the material.
Yes it contains original idea of using self-made sonicator, but it is not essential for this research	Thank you to the reviewer to pointing this out. However, I think that the self-custom made ultrasound generator is an essential part of this study. This is why we mention it in the title. The

	technical detail and performance of the sonicator are reported elsewhere.
This article requires additional data such as XRD spectra, SEM images, FTIR, and Raman spectra	As explained above, we have provided SEM and EDX results in the manuscript. We certainly hope these data will give further proof of GO. As we have limited funding and time at this moment, we have not yet conducted other characterizations, such as XRD, FTIR, and Raman. However, we would like to assure the reviewer that we have done to the best of our effort to complete the manuscript with additional characterizations.

Reviewer 2 (SS16-096 MIA):

Reviewer's Comments	**Author's Comments**
The manuscript is well-written and despite lack of novelty it may bring interest for academician in related fields, regarding the analysis technique discussed in the paper.	We would like to appreciate the reviewer for commenting upon our manuscript. We try to the best of our efforts to bring interesting and hopefully novel manuscripts to be submitted in Makara Journal of Science.
The basic material characterizations such as XRD and SEM should be made. Other than this, the authors discuss the experiment and results well, yet again since there was only one analysis carried out (UV-vis spectrometry).	We would like to thank the reviewer for pointing this out. As explained above, we have added SEM and EDX characterizations to further verify the presence of GO material in our samples. As we have limited funding and time at this moment, we have not yet conducted other characterizations, such as XRD, FTIR, and Raman. However, we would like to assure the reviewer that we have done to the best of our effort to complete the manuscript with additional characterizations.
The title of manuscript is advised to be shorter.	Thank you for the suggestion from the reviewer. We have indeed shorten the title of our manuscript to: --- UV-Visible Optical Absorbance of Graphene Oxide Synthesized from Zinc-Carbon Battery Wastes via a Self-Custom

	Made Ultrasound Generator based on Liquid Sonication Exfoliation Method We left out the words ‘study’, ‘utilizing’, and the phrase ‘piezoelectric probes’ from the title. But we want to keep the phrase ‘self-custom made ultrasound generator’.